Salt Reduction Initiative of the Pan American Forum for Action on NCDs

*Report of the Second SaltSmart Consortium Meeting*

13-14 June, 2013

*PAHO HQ, Washington DC*
Table of Contents

I. Background

II. Opening Session
   a. Introduction with Expectations

III. Committing to the First Five Year Multi-Stakeholder Plan
   a. Feedback Received to the Strategic Plan
   b. Moving Forward the Strategic Objectives

IV. Activating Strategic Objective 1- The Quick Start to the Plan

V. Developing a Model Creative Brief for Work with Advertising Companies
   a. The Role of a Creative Brief
   b. Working Group Sessions

VI. Defining Financial and Management models for Execution of Creative Brief and Identifying Possible Pilot Countries

VII. Conclusions

VIII. Work plan for the Strategic Plan
   a. Sub-groups to Move Forward the Strategic Objectives
   b. Social Marketing Pilot in Trinidad and Tobago

APPENDICES

SALTSMART WORKPLANS June 2013

List of Participants

Meeting Agenda
I. Background

In May 2012, the Pan American Forum for Action on Non-communicable Diseases (PAFNCDs) recommended the establishment of a multi-sector, multi-stakeholder consortium for dietary salt reduction. In August 2012, the Pan American Health Organization/World Health Organization (PAHO) convened the proposed consortium, bringing together representatives of governments, civil society, universities, and major food and beverage companies. Participants branded themselves as the SaltSmart Consortium.

SaltSmart, as an initiative of the PAFNCDs, is to promote a multi-stakeholder approach to reduce salt intake in the Americas by fostering collaboration among governmental and nongovernmental organizations, civil society, and industry. PAHO with SaltSmart is aiming to realize the 2020 goal of salt intake at less than 5g/person/day – a best buy for public health and for the benefit of the people in the Americas.

Following the August meeting, PAHO undertook a participative process to prepare a strategic plan for SaltSmart – the first Five-year Multi-stakeholder Plan (2013 to 2018) – that sets forth the vision, mission, goal, five strategic objectives and corresponding lines of work for the Consortium. The five strategic objectives are:

- Accelerate and expand the reach of social awareness of dietary salt consumption and healthy eating already present in the Region
- Advance and harmonization of targets and timelines for reducing salt/sodium content within the same food group to supply the Region with best in class and best in world products
- Promote and implement reformulation actions of critical/agreed-upon products, leveraging on existing industry voluntary efforts and consistent with best in class and best in world products
- Provide input to the Technical Advisory Group (TAG) to identify the research needed to understand consumer behavior and to advance product reformulations with low/no salt/sodium content
- Working with TAG, (i) promote the implementation of health economic impact analysis in all countries in the region; and (ii) examine the role of the food processing industry regarding the use of iodized salt

The Plan includes a monitoring and evaluation frame, an estimate of the overall resources necessary to mobilize action and an implementation strategy.

In this second meeting, Consortium members were to take two steps consistent with Strategic Plan implementation: confirm commitment to implement the overall Plan; and initiate a “quick start” of the social marketing initiative to activate Strategic Objective 1, intending to accelerate and expand the reach of social awareness, already started in the Region, about the need for dietary salt consumption in the context of healthy eating.
Objectives for the second meeting were:

1. Consortium members confirm commitment to the Five-year Multi-stakeholder Plan for 2013 to 2018, agree on priorities for actions, next steps and a timetable for the Plan.
2. Consortium members review the research methods and instruments applied to understand consumer knowledge, attitudes and behaviors (KAB) regarding salt intake and how KAB research, through a creative brief, informs advertising agencies.
3. Consortium members establish priority actions for Strategic Objective 1; enlist participants’ engagement to work on a social marketing initiative; agree on a timetable, resource requirements and funding options. Members draft a creative brief that would serve an advertising agency in designing social marketing messages that aim to build consumer demand for low/no salt products.

This report summarizes the discussions, presentations, conclusions and next steps decided on during the second meeting. More information about the Consortium and access to full presentations made during the meeting are at the PAFNCDs website http://new.paho.org/panamericanforum/?page_id=1160

II. Opening Session

Dr. Irene Klinger, Director of External Relations, Partnerships and Governing Bodies Department, opened the meeting by reaffirming PAHO’s commitment and that of the SaltSmart participants to reducing average salt intake in the Americas by half by 2020. She noted that the activities planned by the Consortium are aligned with the recommendations of the Regional Cardiovascular Disease Expert Group of PAHO, the PAHO and WHO Action Plans for their respective Strategies for Prevention and Control of Noncommunicable Diseases and the United Nations Declaration of the High Level Meeting of September 2011 in New York on Noncommunicable Diseases. Dr. Klinger expressed the importance of having concrete action to make the reduction of the NCD epidemic in the Region a reality.

Dr. Branka Legetic, Acting Chief for the Chronic Disease Prevention and Control unit, joined Dr. Klinger in the welcoming remarks. She noted that the development of the Consortium, since the launch of the regional initiative to reduce dietary salt in 2009, is elevating and strengthening prevention of NCDs, most notably cardiovascular disease. In 2009 only three countries in the Region were working in dietary salt reduction (USA, Canada and Argentina); currently there are 11 active countries. There is a realization that it must be a multi-stakeholder undertaking, involving different public and private sectors and not only experts.

Following the opening remarks of Drs. Klinger and Legetic, there was a quick roundtable for introductions by participants and expression of their expectations for the meeting.

Introductions and Expectations

- Enaida Plasencia, Communications Specialist, PAHO: To have concrete actions in place
- Victor Coombs, Chairman, Partners Forum, Trinidad and Tobago: Level of energy will rise and there will be dissemination not just from here but down to the workers and families and communities
- Norm Campbell, Professor, University of Calgary: Moving forward and accelerating the action to reduce the salt in foods
- Eduardo Nielsen, Coordinator Food and Nutrition, Ministry of Health Brazil: What this could bring to countries in the Region, everyone together can influence policy
- Trevor Hassell, President, Healthy Caribbean Coalition: A dream that a little salt will go a long way throughout the entire region of the Americas as a result of the deliberation
- Hasan Hutchinson, General Director, Health Canada: To see some concrete actions while understanding that this doesn’t happen overnight. Most important is to build trust within the sectors to make this happen.
- Adriana Blanco, Researcher, INCIENSA: To have action and include more countries as
- some countries from Central America are not involved and not doing anything.
- Felicia Cañete, Director of NCDs, Ministry of Health Paraguay: Concrete actions and interactions with different groups.
- Michael Ramah, Senior Partner, Porter Novelli: Challenge assumptions - the world has changed dramatically in 5 years in how we can bring these programs to life. Hoping to be able to contribute to that thinking.
- Barbara Legowski, Consultant: Building the trust, relationships and looking forward to the convergence of interest
- Maria Rabanal, Scientific, Kraft Foods: Demonstrate that the public and private sector work together to achieve common goals
- Patricia Villalobos, Corporate R&D, Grupo Bimbo: Joint collaboration between the different industry sectors and boost some of the actions already begun.
- Taryn Phillip, Manager Nutrition & Diabetes, Ministry of Health Trinidad & Tobago: Action based on the plans.
- Sylvia Aguilera, Director Federal Government Relations, McDonalds Corp.: Getting to know a lot of people and make more connections, seeing how we can build solutions
- Mychelle Farmer, Technical Advisor, Catholic Relief Services: Action plan that will generate greater collaboration and be able measure the impact on all people of all countries and achieve long term gains.
- Sarah Delea, Associate Director, Kraft Foods: Building the collaboration, the trust, move it forward because it takes a while to get there.
- Henrie Pierre, NHW Food Manager, Nestle: We are quite different in the room but we share the same objective. We need to have clear actions and accelerate them.
- Hubert Linder, Information Advisor, Consumers International: We get concrete actions from this meeting, will not happen overnight. We need to work not only on the long term but also the short term.
- Laura Villarreal, Institutional Communication, ConMexico: We can become an example to other regions of how different sectors can work together to improve health.
- Douglas Balentine, Director Nutrition and Health, Unilever: help foster this consortium, I echo what Nestle said. Time to move forward, we can make progress with public health. There are a lot of public health gains, but it does take time and we need to start in a constructive way.
- Irene Klinger: It’s up to all of us; we take this seriously and show action and results. If we don’t do it, we are jeopardizing the possibility of working in a multi-sector way in any area of health.

III. Committing to the First Five Year Multi-Stakeholder Plan

Dr. Klinger presented the Strategic Plan, its objectives, vision, mission and goal, its five strategic objectives and their goals, lines of work, targets and approach.
Feedback to the Strategic Plan

Trevor Hassell: Section III (purpose of the plan): include in that section relevant issues and roles from the World Health Assembly (in the Assembly there were major outcomes from the NCDs that relate to this whole issue). Clarify that this Plan is going to be undertaken in the context of wider improvements to nutritional status.

Adriana Blanco: Objective 2 needs to be stronger. Add another strategic objective to promote legislation of food products in the Region. Some countries in LAC have strong legislation but in other parts of LAC they are not as well-built, and Central America is a little weak as well as the Caribbean. There should also be a strategic goal for product labeling for consumer so they can make intelligent decisions. Specify in Objective 1 how many countries are involved, need to be more specific. Better specify how, when and where SaltSmart will engage other industries and countries. There needs to be encouragement and promotion of technology transfer among large and small industries.

Douglas Balentine: Legislation on nutrition labeling- it’s important to take some learning from the industry to really understand and drive behavior change. There are models of what makes it easy for consumer behavior change. The knowledge from that area needs to be taken and have PAHO share it. If we have different legislation in different countries, then those industries who sell the products across the Region will have a harder time.

Hubert Linders: Do we have a map showing the salt consumption at country or state levels because there will be differences. Need also a map about legislation on labeling. Mary L’Abbe is developing a phone application to allow consumers to make a snapshot of the food label and indicate a traffic light or a health warning to help the consumer. We need to look at how we can use more technology. Lorena Allemandi, of Argentina, has done some research about NGO’s working in this field. How do we get to all the target audiences; there are many that have to look out for salt.

Henri-Pierre: There needs to be reinforcement of the importance of social awareness to consumerism; we need a positive approach to salt reduction. In Brazil and France, Nestle has been very effective in salt reduction. Labeling and transparent information is a key point. Overall, something that needs to be improved in the Plan is that salt reduction is a very important element to improve the health of the country; however, the more we can reinforce the promotion of vegetables, the more this will help us on salt reduction. Potassium is also a way to reduce sodium and consumers don’t know this fact; if there is awareness it would be easier. There was one expression in the Plan about best in world products; this is a good ambition but maybe not realistic.

Mychelle Farmer: In general it is a well thought out document. A recommendation would be to make sure we articulate the intention to adopt a life course approach in the work that we are going to do. On objective 3, there is need to address advertising in children but in objective 4 this is not as obvious. The idea should be to include something about adopting a life course approach under the strategic lines of work so that it shows the importance of children, young adults and women of reproductive age.

Victor Coombs: The removal of salt shakers in the tables should be mentioned in some area of the Plan. The document was good in identifying targets but in others it was not as specific in how to achieve those targets. For example, on data collection, in some countries there may be no adequate data collection or no capacity for epidemiological surveys or testing. The idea of a toolkit is effective; it works for the
community and national level and it could be easily understood and executed. It would be helpful if we can package some success stories in a simple fashion and make it available worldwide. In methodology we should use pictures and make it easier for the end consumer, since the literacy in some smaller countries is low on average. Finally, to include also the workforce as a target group, starting with the food industry; all workforces influence their industries. This could be a leading light or set an example for the rest.

Hasan Hutchinson: We are talking about sodium itself. One has to make sure to work sodium reduction into more comprehensive healthy eating strategies. Implementation may be easier if it’s positioned in the larger context of nutrition (i.e. sugar consumption, salt, sodium, etc). Struggling with the term ‘best in world’ products; it’s a nice ambition but not right for this.

Bill Smith: The biggest value and weakness of the Plan is that it’s comprehensive; it is not clear as to where to start. The biggest contribution is that everyone around the table can work together and prove that it works.

Michael Ramah: We need to consider and think how we decide to move forward. Progress comes with sacrifice.

Maria Rosa Rabanal: It is difficult to work on all the elements at the same time. We need to prioritize on the nutrients.

Moving Forward the Strategic Objectives:

- Experiences with research on consumer KAB regarding salt intake - methods, instruments, target audiences

Hasan Hutchinson (Health Canada):

Dr. Hutchinson spoke about the current ongoing social marketing project in Canada. He urged a more comprehensive approach regarding salt reduction. A gap analysis to inform the social marketing plan for sodium indicated that there is a lack of consistent messages, confusion among consumers, and there is a need to improve the health literacy of Canadians. In response, Health Canada is working on consistent messages in the marketing campaign, to make it easy for the consumer to understand.

- The target audience is care givers of young children or young moms and dads, since their knowledge regarding sodium is of minimum level.
- The main focus is on awareness and developing skills in the context of healthy eating.
- It is important to get evidenced based messages that are tested in different areas and languages.
  - Once the messages have been developed, there is different outreach (i.e. introducing messages in the different seasons).
  - In the Health Canada website there are different fact sheets, presentations, quizzes, etc. for use in different presentations solely by experts. There is also another area directed to consumers (i.e. facebook, twitter, etc)
- In conclusion, Canada’s approach demonstrates consistent work across all sectors and the messages are constant for the consumer.
Adriana Blanco (INCIENSA):

- A pilot study was performed in Costa Rica, Argentina y Ecuador.
  - The objective of the study was to identify KAB about salt and the labeling of products.
- Three techniques were used: interviews with guides, direct observations and focus groups. The informants were community leaders (teachers, scout leaders).
- In all the groups there were men and women, mostly well educated. However, Ecuador was more limited.
  - Costa Rica: the population was greater
  - In general people in the three countries see salt as an important condiment that gives taste to food.
  - In regards to sodium:
    - Ecuadorians did not know what sodium is; they associated it with energy.
    - In Costa Rica they did not know the difference between sodium and salt; sodium was seen as a chemical that it is learned about in chemistry class in high school.

Hubert Linders (Consumers International):

- Consumers International performed a study that was carried out in five countries
- A questionnaire was established together with a few people and the idea was to gather KAB information regarding salt from consumers (around 400).
  - What was found is that people said they knew the difference between sodium and salt. However, when asked to explain, they did not know or came up with all kinds of answers. Only one in ten knew the difference.
  - They also did research on education level and the people with secondary level scored lower than the primary level when asked the difference between salt and sodium.
  - Several cases of people having a disease to which high salt intake contributes did not know the relation between high salt consumption and their disease.
- Medical doctors don’t give consistent messages to patients.
- This is why the campaign of PAHO “Know your numbers” is important, because people need to get tested and gain knowledge of their health.
- Consumers International has been provided information regarding salt consumption to member organizations (i.e. ALAS), and has forwarding all the factsheets and websites.

Henri Pierre (Nestle):

- Nestlé’s worldwide research found that consumer awareness is not consistent across markets.
- Additionally it was discovered that there is also significant confusion between salt and sodium. People learned the difference when they or someone in the family developed hypertension or had a good doctor. However, many consumers who know that they need to reduce their salt intake do not take action.
- People are somewhat aware that high salt intake is harmful to health but it is not their top concern regarding nutrition.
- The messages to use less salt or products labeled as having lowered salt content are associated with poor taste. Consumers are also more skeptical: if there is less salt, they wonder what else is hidden.
- Nestlé’s Actions:
  - Adapt to consumer knowledge
  - Use a step-wise approach to reformulation, as each product is different
  - Use appropriate means of communication to inform consumers (i.e. labeling, education, behavioral marketing, in-home visits to understand behaviours, booklets with cooking tips)
  - Do not communicate ‘reductions’ to consumers

Sarah Delea (Kraft Foods):
- Kraft has looked at consumer diets overall
  - The movement is to be healthier; it’s not about dieting but about what is good, natural, fits to the lifestyle and values.
  - There are concerns about ingredient sources and production methods.
  - The claims have shifted away from less salt or fat to more about natural organic ingredients
  - Food safety continues to be a concern (i.e. how the product was made or is the consumer comfortable eating it).
  - Consumers don’t want to be told what not to do.

Douglas Balentine (Unilever):
- A global survey was performed in collaboration with IUNS, based on consumer behavioral change.
  - It was done online; equal male and female population
- Different consumers in many countries were interviewed and it was found that consumers are ingredient sensitive and most of them relate salt to good taste.
- Unilever decided to understand how to create behavior change and reduce salt.
  - Consumers believe that a lower sodium and salt makes food healthier.
- There is a general attitude that consumers can get used to meals with less salt, but not many people check the label for salt content.
- Consumers want to know more about salt and its impact on their health; as well as to get a better idea of how much salt they are consuming. They want to learn that from the labels, and media (TV commercials and website).

IV. Activating Strategic Objective 1- The Quick Start on Social Marketing

Bill Smith, Consultant
Mr. Smith stated that SaltSmart needs to build credibility and needs funds for the quick start. He pointed out how the Canadian experience is outstanding; it’s a great example of marketing.

Food trends must be taken into consideration when designing a social marketing strategy i.e. the age group of the trendsetters and what they are doing. The social marketing products don’t need to be food; there are things we can do, a simple tool. For instance, “red carding” taken from soccer has been used by women to say ‘no’ to men and prevent sexual violence. These are things we can take into account when thinking creatively.
Through labeling there are a lot of options. What does it mean to reduce fat? If you want to change behavior, you need to be specific. For example, creating a mobile application can be empowering; there are various apps to take pictures of the label and send it to a database. This is an empowering movement to those who want to be active on the salt reduction programs.

It would be ideal to find a product to accelerate the quick start on social marketing

- If we could activate countries that could help the industry
- The easiest way could be for Ministers of Health to buy into this plan. It is good to have cooperation between the industry and government.

However, it could be hard to do the “how” without knowing the “what”. It is difficult to answer what to do because there is not one thing that people can do.

**A Model Creative Brief for Work with Advertising Agencies**

**The role of a creative brief (Michael Ramah and Bill Smith):**

What could bring the consumer into the movement for salt intake reduction? People usually are confused about nutrition; they have a lot of choices to make and it needs to be clear. Trends are important, they are a hook. One trend is about “natural food”. Marketing people know they must promote products forever; public health people think they solve the problems forever with one initiative. Social marketing like product marketing is a constantly evolving process. Social media is a loud voice; it can easily work for or against you.

- **Brainstorming results:**
  - Using the historic relationship of salt and currency
  - The fact that this action will occur with a cultural setting, so not all cultures will act the same
  - Use positive emotions to drive behaviors (i.e. pleasure, taste)
  - Things that are sexy: the food would taste better if its naked
  - Emotional stories about moms and their children (i.e. the moms campaign)
  - Someone or something you love, a link
  - The link between tears and salt
  - Less is more as in beauty and elegance.
  - Salt shaker exploding, like a time bomb
  - The taste aspect: replacing the salt shaker
  - Portraying salt as a bully over other flavours
  - Gesture of throwing the salt over shoulder to avoid bad luck
  - “little salt, big hug/smile/taste/big society” (teenager and girlfriend, mom and son)
  - The salt shakers arms: don’t get it, don’t shake it
  - “no seas salado”
Working Group Sessions

Each of two groups developed a product suggestion.

- **Group 1:**
  - “Less is more”: less salt being better for you (less perfume, clothes, work, etc).
    We think about flavor, the original flavor of foods (going back to natural tastes).
    The idea of less salt and more flavors also brings about better health.

- **Group 2:**
  - “Mas vida/More life”: you’ll be sexier and food will taste better with less salt.
    Less salt = better and healthier life.

Accepting “Less is more” is the product idea, each group decided on a target audience.

- **Group 1:**
  - Sarita is a very loving, caring mother of two in a busy household. Striving to be better, she wants to be a great wife, mother, daughter in law. She is lower to middle class. She is very connected to her community. But she sometimes feels guilty because would like to once in a while make a proper meal. Less is more; she can add spice to the life of her family. And that could happen in the dinner table. Little things can make a big difference, you can make a lot with little and that includes with your food. There are other ways to give flavor while using less or no salt.

- **Group 2:**
  - Daniela is a new, successful mom, aspiring for change, understanding that less is more. She can actually be a great mom with less. She is open to change and finds information in social networks of other new moms. They influence each other in a large if not global network. In the household, living as a couple and family, dads have more say.

Open question: What do we think will influence these people? Are they influenced by social norms? Or by facts? Facts can influence on a very large scale but very rarely.

V. Conclusions

- The Strategic Plan is an important guidance document and it will be enriched with the inputs from this meeting.
- SaltSmart needs connectedness to continue moving forward; there needs to be an interactive platform.
- The Consortium needs a quick win; Trinidad and Tobago are in last stage of the preparation for national base line study on salt intake and main sources of salt. They offer to use results from the study to plan intervention that will include pilot of social marketing strategy.
VI. Work plan for the Strategic Plan

Sub-groups to Move Forward the Strategic Objectives

Participants were divided into two groups to review Strategic Objectives 2 to 5 and develop preliminary workplans. (See Appendix 1.)

Two sub-groups, self-identified, will lead work as follows:

- Strategic Objectives 2 and 3: Advance the harmonization of targets and timelines for reducing salt/sodium content within the same food groups; and promote and implement reformulation actions to reduce salt/sodium in a group of agreed-upon products, leveraging existing industry voluntary efforts.
- Sub-group: Douglas Balentine (Unilever), Sylvia Aguilera (McDonalds), Henri-Pierre Lenoble (Nestle), Norm Campbell (University of Calgary, Canada), Hubert Linders (Consumers International, South America), Eduardo Nilson (Ministry of Health, Brazil), Maria Rosa Rabanal (Kraft) Lorena Allemandi (IAHF)

- Strategic Objectives 4 and 5: Provide input to the TAG to identify research needed to understand consumer behaviours and advance food product formulations with low/no salt/sodium content; and working with TAG, (i) promote the implementation of health economic impact analysis in all countries in the region and (ii) examine the role of the food processing industry regarding the use of iodized salt.
- Sub-group: Taryn Philips (Ministry of Health, Trinidad and Tobago), Mychelle Farmer (Health/Catholic Relief Services), Hubert Linders, Sarah Delea (Kraft), Lorena Allemandi.
The workplans combine the inputs from the 13-14 June 2013 SaltSmart Consortium meeting (Washington DC) with the lines of work, goals and approaches as stated for Strategic Objectives 2 to 5 in the SaltSmart Consortium First 5-year Multi-stakeholder Plan (2013 – 2018).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strategic Objectives</th>
<th>Targets</th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014</th>
<th>2015</th>
<th>2016</th>
<th>2017</th>
<th>2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strategic Objective 2: Advance the harmonization of targets and timelines for reducing salt/sodium content within the same food group to supply the region with the best in class and best in world products</td>
<td>75% of countries in the region have targets and timelines</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Strategic Objective 3: Promote and implement reformulation actions of critical/agreed-upon products, leveraging on existing industry voluntary efforts and consistent with best in class and best in world products | - The food industry is providing food composition data to a central database e.g. LATINFOODS  
- The large nationals and multinational food companies are engaged with SME to promote technology transfer, as appropriate, consistent with intellectual property concerns  
- Large nationals and multinationals sign the 2011 Rio Declaration |      |      |      |      |      |      |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tasks</th>
<th>How to</th>
<th>Timeframe</th>
<th>Responsibility</th>
<th>Resources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Clarify target ranges for key food categories/products</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>TAG</td>
<td>“Guide for Setting Targets and Timelines to Reduce the Salt Content of Foods”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Task</td>
<td>Responsible Parties</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develop regional standards for sodium content of staple or common food products</td>
<td>TAG</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promote and support uptake of sodium targets in countries that do not have them</td>
<td>PAHO at summit of health ministers; PAHO, NGOs and industry at national levels. Sub group prepares schedule of strategic interventions. PAHO; network of health advocates/allies (eg ALASS); industry</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Review regional centralized food composition database systems and processes eg LATINFOODS</td>
<td>TAG</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discuss and draft a system for food industry to supply food composition data to central database</td>
<td>Involve industry, TAG, LATINFOODS, other relevant international players</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multinationals in Consortium sign on to 2011 Rio Declaration</td>
<td>PAHO, PAFNCDs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advance the research on sources of salt (by country and as a region)</td>
<td>TAG, other workgroup</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- disseminate and workshop the “Protocol for Population-Level Sodium Determination in 24-Hour Urine Samples” and the “Review of Methods to Determine Main Sources of Sodium in the Diet”</td>
<td>PAFNCDs “Protocol for Population-Level Sodium Determination in 24-Hour Urine Samples” “Review of Methods to Determine Main Sources of Sodium in the Diet”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Task</td>
<td>Responsible Party</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Share technology for salt reduction</td>
<td>Multinationals working with national food associations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map the countries moving ahead in which the consumer environments are ready for low/no salt/sodium products</td>
<td>Industry lead</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mobilize relevant stakeholders</td>
<td>Entire Consortium</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To scale-up and replicate good practices, develop an inventory of best practices on product reformulations which reduce salt, and other achievements and communicate</td>
<td>Industry lead</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Strategic Objectives

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strategic Objective 4: Provide input to the Technical Advisory Group (TAG) to identify the research needed to understand consumer behavior and to advance product reformulations with low/no salt/sodium content</th>
<th>Targets</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strategic Objective 5: Working with TAG, (i) promote the implementation of health economic impact analysis in all countries in the region; and (ii) examine the role of the food processing industry regarding the use of iodized salt</td>
<td>Targets</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014</th>
<th>2015</th>
<th>2016</th>
<th>2017</th>
<th>2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Strategic Objective 4:</strong> Provide input to the Technical Advisory Group (TAG) to identify the research needed to understand consumer behavior and to advance product reformulations with low/no salt/sodium content</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Research issues compiled</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Strategic Objective 5:</strong> Working with TAG, (i) promote the implementation of health economic impact analysis in all countries in the region; and (ii) examine the role of the food processing industry regarding the use of iodized salt</td>
<td>Ongoing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Tasks

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tasks</th>
<th>How to</th>
<th>Timeframe</th>
<th>Responsibility</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Recognize the main sources of salt:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Processed food: generate an overview of current nutritional labelling requirements and data in each country.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Formal and informal out of home: understand the sources.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Household (added salt): understand the behaviour.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Design a map based on a literature review. Find indicators of capacity; this will give a framework.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Divide the countries into 2 groups: those already reporting nutritional content and those who</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Resources</th>
<th>Desk researcher</th>
<th>Data processor</th>
<th>“Review of Methods to Determine Main Sources of Sodium in the Diet”</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Desk researcher</td>
<td>Data processor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Step</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Don’t and start from there to set where we can go (legally and in capacity) in each country.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Categorize consumers: urban, rural, age, gender, to specify target and get to know their behaviour.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Recognize the behaviour determinants on each category (consumers’ drive)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Use the WHO model and apply to other countries. Use data that are available eg USA or Canada</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Produce economic impact studies independent of the starting point of salt reduction eg impact of health costs.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 6. | - Share/disseminate the inventory of tools, current best practices and other information on how to conduct health economic analysis  
- Capacity building at the country-level to obtain data and help foster how to conduct a health economic analysis specific to a country |
| 7. | Iodized salt: |
| 8. | Create an inventory of the use of iodized salt (whether iodized salt is universal ie in table and manufacturing salt, or limited to table salt:  
  - What is the regulation in each country  
  - Predict what will happen if reduce salt intake to 5 grams a day eg require recalibration of iodine concentrations in salt. |
| 9. | Compile research results and other best practices regarding the effects of various iodine concentrations on flavor |
| 10. | Critically appraise new evidence on dietary salt and report on findings in both scientific and lay terms |

**Statistics expert**
| Conduct scholarly reviews on the state of sodium literature and publish/disseminate the findings |
| Update the guidelines on salt iodization monitoring at the population level |
APPENDIX 2: Second Meeting of the SaltSmart Consortium

13-14 June 2013
PAHO, ROOM C, WASHINGTON, D.C.

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

AGUILERA, Sylvia
Director, Federal Government Relations
McDonalds Corporation
E-mail: Sylvia.Aguilera@us.mcd.com

ALLEMANDI, Lorena
Project Manager
Inter-American Heart Association
Buenos Aires, Argentina
E-mail: lorena.allemendi@ficargentina.org

BALENTINE, Douglas
Director Nutrition and Health
Unilever
800 Sylvan Ave,
Englewood Cliffs, NJ 07632
E-mail: douglas.balentine@unilever.com

BLANCO-METZLER, Adriana
Researcher,
Instituto Costarricense de investigación y Enseñanza en Nutrición y Salud (INCIENSA )
Tres Rios, San José, Costa Rica
E-mail: ablanco@inciensa.sa.cr

CAMPBELL, Norm
Professor
Departments of Medicine, Community Health Sciences and Pharmacology and Therapeutics
Health Science Centre, University of Calgary
Calgary, Alberta, Canada
E-mail: ncampbel@ucalgary.ca

CAÑETE, Felicia
Director de Enfermedades No Transmisibles
Ministerio de Salud
Asuncion, Paraguay
E-mail: feliciacanete@gmail.com

COOMBS, Victor
Chairman, Partner Forum for NCD
c/o Ministry of Health
Trinidad and Tobago
gmeshltd@gmail.com

CORONA, Zully
Regulatory Affairs Manager
Grupo Bimbo
Prolongación Paseo de la Reforma No. 1000,
Col. Pena Blanca Santa Fe Deleg. Alvaro Obregón C.P. 01210 México DF
E-mail: zully.corona@grupobimbo.com

DELEA, Sarah
Associate Director,
Corporate Issues Management
Kraft Foods Headquarters
E-mail: sarah.delea@kraftfoods.com

FARMER, Mychelle
Technical Advisor, Health
Catholic Relief Services
Baltimore, Maryland
E-mail: mychelle.farmer@crs.org

FERNANDES NILSON, Eduardo Augusto
National Coordinator
Food and Nutrition
Ministerio de Salud del Brasil
Brasilia, D.F.
E-mail: Eduardo@saude.gov.br

HASSELL, Trevor
President
Healthy Caribbean Coalition
Bridgetown, Barbados
E-mail: thassell@caribsurf.com
HUTCHINSON, Hasan
General Director
Office of Nutrition Policy and Promotion
Health Canada
Ottawa, Ontario, Canada K1A 0K9
E-mail: hasan.hutchinson@hc-sc.gc.ca

LANNON, Chris
Managing Director, McGill World Platform for Health and Economic Convergence
E-mail: chris.lannon@mcgill.ca

LINDER, Hubert
Information Advisor
Consumers International
Santiago, Chile
Email: hlinders@consumidoresint.org

MEER, Jeff
Special Advisor for Global Health
Public Health Institute
529 14th St NW # 650
Washington, DC 20045
E-mail: jmeer@phi.org

PHILIPS, Taryn
Manager Nutrition & Dietetics
Ministry of Health
Trinidad and Tobago

PIERRE LENOBLE, Henrie
NHW Manager Food SBU
Nestlé, Headquarters
Switzerland
E-mail: henri-pierre.lenoble@nestle.com

RABANAL, Maria Rosa
Scientific, Regulatory Affairs and Nutrition Manager for Southern Cone and H&W LA
Kraft Foods
Buenos Aires, Argentina
E-mail: maria.rabanal@mdlz.com

VILLARREAL, Laura
Institutional Communication
ConMexico
Av. Ejército Nacional #904 Piso 10,

VILLALOBOS, Patricia
Corporate R&D VP
Grupo Bimbo
Prolongación Paseo de la Reforma No. 1000,
Col. Pena Blanca Santa Fe Deleg. Alvaro
Obregón C.P. 01210 México DF
E-mail: pvilloli@grupobimbo.com

PAHO:
Irene Klinger
Manager
External Relations, Resource Mobilization and Partnerships
E-mail: klingeri@paho.org

Branka Legetic
Acting Coordinator, Chronic Disease Prevention and Control
E-mail: legeticb@paho.org

Mauricio Pardón
Senior Advisor, Partnerships and Multi-Sector Collaboration
E-mail: pardonm@paho.org

Eneida Plasencia
Communications Specialist, Partnerships and Multi-Sector Collaboration

Frances Sabatier
Assistant, Partnerships and Multi-Sector Collaboration
E-mail: sabatief@paho.org

Paulo Lyra
Advisor, Communication and Networking
E-mail: lyrapaul@paho.org
Consultants:

Barbara Legowski  
Temporary Advisor  
Ottawa, Canada  
E-mail: legowski@rogers.com

Michael L.E. Ramah  
Senior Partner, Chief Client Officer  
Porter Novelli  
7 World Trade Center  
250 Greenwich Street, 36th floor  
New York, NY 10007  
E-mail: mrham@porternovelli.com

Bill Smith  
Editor Social marketing Quarterly  
The Science of improving Lives FHI360  
E-mail: makingchange4u@gmail.com
APPENDIX 3: Meeting Agenda

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8:30-9:00am</td>
<td>REGISTRATION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:00-9:15am</td>
<td>WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(15min)</td>
<td>Irene Klinger, Manager, External Relations, Resource Mobilization and Partnerships, ERP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Branka Legetic, Acting Coordinator, Health Surveillance and Disease Prevention and Control/Noncommunicable Disease, HSD/NC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:15-9:30am</td>
<td>REVIEW OF MEETING AGENDA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(15min)</td>
<td>Review objectives and agenda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Introduction of participants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Branka Legetic, Acting Coordinator, HSD/NC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:30-9:50am</td>
<td>IMPLEMENTING THE MULTISTAKEHOLDER PLAN: COMMITTING TO THE FIRST FIVE-YEAR JOINT EFFORT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(20min)</td>
<td>Review of the Strategic Plan (2013/2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Irene Klinger, Manager, ERP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:50-10:30am</td>
<td>Comments by participants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(40min)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:30 – 11:00</td>
<td>COFFEE BREAK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:00-12:30pm</td>
<td>Moving forward the Strategic Objectives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1:30 min)</td>
<td>Harmonization of targets and reformulation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Research and Technical Advisory Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Divide in two Sub-Groups.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Agree on priority actions and lines of work.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Define timetable for action.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Explore resource requirements and funding options.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Report back, consolidate ideas.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Coordinated by:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mauricio Pardon, Senior Advisor, ERP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Barbara Legowski, Consultant</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Friday, June 14

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Session</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12:30-1:30pm</td>
<td><strong>LUNCH</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1:45-3:15pm</td>
<td><strong>ACTIVATING STRATEGIC OBJECTIVE 1 — The Quick Start on Social Marketing</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Review the Strategic objectives and role of Social Marketing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>(45 min)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Bill Smith, Consultant</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3:15-3:40pm</td>
<td>- A social marketing campaign begins with consumer research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>(25 min)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Michael Ramah, Porter Novelli</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3:45 – 4:15pm</td>
<td><strong>COFFEE BREAK</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3:40 – 4:45pm</td>
<td><strong>Experiences with research on consumer KAB regarding salt intake –</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>methods, instruments, target audiences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Hasan Hutchinson, Canada</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Adriana Blanco-Metzler, Costa Rica</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Hubert Linders, Consumers International for Latin America,</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Industry presentation of consumer research in LAC</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4:45-5:00pm</td>
<td><strong>Small groups: Lessons learned from consumer research</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5:00 – 5:15pm</td>
<td><strong>Small groups: Discuss content of KAP development</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5:15-5:45 pm</td>
<td><strong>Plenary: Small group presentations</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5:45-6:00pm</td>
<td><strong>ADJOURN</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Welcome Back**

- Reflections on Day 1  
  *Branka Legetic, Acting Coordinator, HSD/NC*
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Activity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9:00-9:30am</td>
<td><strong>Develop Model Creative Brief for Work with Advertising Companies</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:30-10:30am</td>
<td>• What is a role of creative brief</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bill Smith, Consultant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Michael Ramah, Porter Novelli</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:30-11:00am</td>
<td>• Small group: address strategic goals and possible audiences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Small group reports back</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:00-11:30am</td>
<td><strong>COFFEE BREAK</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:30-12:00pm</td>
<td>• Small group: key behaviors and audiences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:00-12:15pm</td>
<td>o Small group reports back</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:15-1:30pm</td>
<td><strong>Define financial and management models for execution of creative brief</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>and identify possible pilot countries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bill Smith, Consultant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1:30-2:00pm</td>
<td><strong>CLOSING OF THE MEETING</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Irene Klinger, Manager, ERP</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>